Appeal No 9

Appeals Committee: J Gerard (Chair); G Endicott (scribe); J C Beineix; E d'Orsi; J Polisner

Event: Seniors Bowl
Round: 19 Table
Teams: Israel v Egypt

Board 5 . Dealer North . North/South Vulnerable.

	♠ 9 8 3 ♡ A Q ♢ A 9 7 2 ♣ Q 8 7 5	
♠ Q 5 ♡ 10 9 7 5 ♢ Q 8 5 4 ♣ A 4 3		♠ 10 7 4 2 ♡ 6 4 3 ♢ K J 10 6 ♣ 10 6
	♠ A K J 6 ♡ K J 8 2 ♢ 3 ♣ K J 9 2	

West	North	East	South
Pass	1♣	Pass	1♡
Pass	1NT	Pass	2♠
Pass	2NT	Pass	3♣
Pass	3♡	Pass	4♣
Pass	4♡	Pass	5♣*
Pass	5♢	Pass	6♣

* uncontested long hesitation

Comments: It was agreed that the tray had returned very slowly after the 5♣ call was made
Contract: 6♣ by North
Opening Lead: Not material
Play: Not material
Result: 12 tricks; NS +920
The Facts: The Director was called to the table by East when the bid of 5♢ was made. East asked for a Law 73F1 ruling given that the bid was made after a long delay in returning the tray
The Director:. Learnt that North did not dispute the slow return of the try
Ruling: After consulting expert players, who all agreed that pass wa a logical alternative to 5♢, the director adjusted the result to 5♣+1 = NS +420
Relevant Laws: 73F1; 16
North/South appealed
Present: All players and Captains
The Players: North pointed out that his partner had shown an above-value hand with a singleton diamond. He considered he had the values to continue the bidding. His captain contributed a suggestion that the bidding invited a choice of contract, either 6♣ or 7♣
The Committee: Noted the unanimous opinions of the several strong players consulted. Was of the opinion that North's club suit was too tenuous for him to be thinking of six clubs without prompting. There could be no doubt in this case as to which player had broken tempo. Solely in regard to the question of forfeiting or

	returning the deposit one member of the committee observed that, leaving aside the judgement of his values, the only logical meaning of the sequence adopted by North was to invite a choice of the slam level to be played; it was legitimate for the North/South side to present this argument.
The Committee's decision:	The Director's ruling upheld
Deposit:	Returned, very reluctantly